

## Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 GENEVA 06623 01 OF 02 191042Z

12

ACTION ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 ACDE-00 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 NSAE-00 NSCE-00

SSO-00 USIE-00 INRE-00 ERDA-05 AF-08 ARA-06 EA-07

EUR-12 PM-04 H-02 INR-07 IO-13 L-03 NASA-01 NEA-10

NSC-05 OIC-02 SP-02 PA-01 PRS-01 OES-06 SS-15 SAJ-01

/122 W

----- 047326

O R 190929Z AUG 76

FM USMISSION GENEVA

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 1935

INFO AMEMBASSY BONN

AMEMBASSY LONDON

AMEMBASSY KOW

AMEMBASSY THE HAGUE

AMEMBASSY OTTAWA

AMEMBASSY ROME

AMEMBASSY STOCKHOLM

AMEMBASSY TOKYO

USMISSION USUN NEW YORK

USMISSION NATO

ERDA HQ WASHDC

ERDA GERMANTOWN

NOAA ROCKVILLE MD

AMEMBASSY BELGRADE

AMEMBASSY BUCHAREST

AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI

AMEMBASSY ISLAMABAD

AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES

AMEMBASSY MEXICO

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 1 OF 2 GENEVA 6623

DISTO

E.O. 11652: GDS

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 GENEVA 06623 01 OF 02 191042Z

TAGS: PARM, CCD

SUBJECT: CCD - ENMOD NEGOTIATIONS: ARTICLE I

1. THIS MESSAGE REPORTS ON DEL'S RECENT CONSULTATIONS WITH DELEGATIONS MOST ACTIVELY INVOLVED IN ARTICLE I QUESTION AND REQUESTS AUTHORIZATION TO ACCEPT FORMULATION SUGGESTED BY ARGENTINA (PARA 19 BELOW) AS REPLACEMENT FOR "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE" CRITERIA.

2. USDEL APPROACHED YUGOSLAV, DUTCH, CANADIAN, MEXICAN, ROMANIAN, PAKISTANI, INDIAN, SWEDISH, AND ARGENTINE DELOFFS AUGUST 16-18 TO EXPLORE POSSIBILITIES OF ACHIEVING BROAD AGREEMENT ON ENMOD CONVENTION BEFORE CONCLUSION OF CCD SUMMER SESSION. WHILE SOME DELGATIONS (NETHERLANDS, INDA, SWEDEN) CLEARLY WERE ABLE, DESPITE RESERVATIONS, TO GO ALONG WITH SCOPE OF TREATY AS DEFINED BY "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE" CRITERIA AND BY ACCOMPANYING INTERPRETATIONS, OTHERS (PARTICULARLY YUGOSLAVIA, MEXICO, AND ARGENTINA) INDICATED FLATLY THAT PRESENT ARTICLE I WOULD BE UNACCEPTABLE TO THEM.

3. DELOFFS STRESSED THAT USG STRONGLY SUPPORTS EXISTING FORMULATION AND THAT USDEL HAS NOT BEEN AUTHORIZED TO ACCEPT ANY CHANGES. HOWEVER, TO THOSE DELEGATIONS INDICATING OPPOSITION ON ARTICLE I, DELOFFS STATED THEIR WILLINGNESS TO DISCUSS, ON A STRICTLY PERSONAL AND EXPLORATORY BASIS, POSSIBLE REFORMULATIONS THAT WOULD PRESERVE THE THRESHOLD WHILE ENABLING CRITICS TO JOIN IN SUPPORT OF ENTIRE TREATY TEXT. DELOFFS SAID THAT THEY WERE NOT PREPARED TO ENTERTAIN SUGGESTIONS FOR ABANDONING THRESHOLD CONCEPT OR FOR SETTING THRESHOLD AT LOWER LEVEL (E.G. BY MODIFYING COSPONSORS' INTERPRETATIONS OF "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE" CRITERIA). HIGHLIGHTS OF DISCUSSIONS WITH ABOVE-MENTIONED DELS FOLLOW.

4. YUGOSLAV DELOFF (MIHAJLOVIC) REITERATED HIS GOVERNMENT'S SUPPORT FOR COMPREHENSIVE BAN, BUT SAID HE PERSONALLY BELIEVES BELGRADE WOULD SUPPORT PARTIAL MEASURE IF THE TERMS "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE" WERE REMOVED AND IF TREATY CONTAINED COMMITMENT

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 GENEVA 06623 01 OF 02 191042Z

TO CONTINUE NEGOTIATIONS TOWARD A COMPREHENSIVE PROHIBITION. HE ALSO SAID TITLE (CONVENTION ON THE PROHIBITION OF MILITARY OR ANY OTHER HOSTILE USE OF ENVIRONMENTAL MODIFICATION TECHNIQUES) SHOULD BE CHANGED (PERHAPS TO "CONVENTION ON THE LIMITATION . . .") IN ORDER TO REFLECT PARTIAL SCOPE OF CONVENTION. IN ADDITION, HE ARGUED THAT PROHIBITION SHOULD APPLY TO ENMOD USE AGAINST ALL STATES, NOT JUST STATES PARTY.

5. MIHAJLOVIC EXPRESSED NO INTEREST IN DELOFF'S TWO SUGGESTIONS FOR REPLACING " WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE" WITH THREE SYNONYMOUS WORDS OR PHRASES ("EXTENSIVE, PRESISTING, OR VERY SERIOUS EFFECTS," "EFFECTS OF A SIGNIFICANT EXTENT, LONG DURATION, OR VERY SERIOUS NATURE"), INDICATING THAT THESE FORMULATIONS WERE "JUST AS BAD" AS THE EXISTING ONE. HOWEVER, HE CONSIDERED A THIRD ALTERNATIVE ("HAVING EFFECTS, AS DESCRIBED IN ANNEX I, PRESENTING SERIOUS DANGERS TO ANOTHER STATE PARTY") TO BE A "DEFINITE IMPROVEMENT."

6. DELOFF ARGUED THAT IT WOULD NOT BE APPROPRIATE TO INCLUDE COMMITMENT TO CONTINUE NEGOTIATIONS TOWARD A COMPREHENSIVE BAN, SINCE WE BELIEVE PRESENT SCOPE OF PROHIBITION WILL BE ADEQUATE TO DEAL EFFECTIVELY WITH ANY SERIOUS DANGERS POSED BY DEVELOPMENT OF ENMOD TECHNIQUES. IF TREATY PARTIES, ON BASIS OF EXPERIENCE AFTER TREATY ENTERED INTO FORCE, CONSIDERED SCOPE INADEQUATE, THEY WOULD HAVE RESOURSE IN REVIEW AND AMENDMENT PROCEDURES. PER STATE 183436, DELOFF SAID WE WOULD BE WILLING TO CONSIDER LANGUAGE IN REVIEW CONFERENCE PROVISION INDICATING THAT A RESPONSIBILITY OF THE CONFERENCE WOULD BE TO EXAMINE EFFECTIVNESS OF TREATY IN ELIMINATING DANGERS OF HOSTILE USE OF ENMOD TECHNIQUES.

7. ON ISSUE OF "STATES PARTY," DELOFF HELD THAT NEITHER WE NOR MANY OTHER DELS WERE PREPARED TO EXTEND COMMITMENT TO ALL STATES AND THEREBY WEAKEN INCENTIVES FOR ADHERENCE.

8. WHEN PRESSED REGARDING CHANGES THAT WOULD PERMIT  
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 GENEVA 06623 01 OF 02 191042Z

YUGOSLAVIA TO GO ALONG WITH CONVENTION, MIHAJLOVIC SAID THAT HE COULD NOT PREDICT BELGRADE'S RESPONSE, BUT THAT HE WOULD RECOMMEND ACCEPTANCE IF (A) "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE" WERE REPLACED BY FORMULATION ALONG LINES OF THRID ALTERNATIVE IN PARA 5; (B) REVIEW CONFERENCE PROVISION CONTAINED REFERENCE TO RESPONSIBILITY TO EXAMINE TREATY'S EFFECTIVENESS IN ELIMINATING DANGERS, ETC.; AND (C) TITLE WERE CHANGED. (HOWEVER, IN CONVERSATION SUBSEQUENT TO ABOVE, MIHAJLOVIC REPEATED ADVOCACY OF CHANGING "STATE PARTY" TO "STATE." HE MADE SAME POINT IN AUUST 18 ENMOD WORKING GROUP MEETING. IT THUS IS UNCERTAIN HOW INSISTENTLY YUGOSLAVAS MIGHT SEEK TO DELETE "PARTY".)

9. DUTCH DELOFF (MEERBURG) INDICATED THAT, WHILE

NETHERLANDS SUPPORTED COMPREHENSIVE BAN  
AND SYMPATHIZED WITH ARGUMENTS RE LEGAL COMPLICATIONS OF  
USING "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING OR SEVERE" BOTH IN ENMOD  
AND LAWS OF WAR CONTEXTS, DUTCH GOVERNMENT WOULD PROBABLY  
BE WILLING TO GO ALONG WITH ARTICLE I VIRTUALLY UNCHANGED  
IF MOST OTHERS WERE PREPARED TO DO SO.

10. CANADIAN DELOFF (SIMARD) SAID THAT CANADA WAS NOT  
CONCERNED BY "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE" PER  
SE, BUT BY LEGAL IMPLICATIONS OF INTERPRETING IDENTICAL  
TERMS IN DIFFERENT WAYS IN SEPARATE LEGAL REGIMES.  
ACCORDING TO SIMARD, OTTAWA THOUGHT BEST COURSE WAS TO  
DROP ANNEX. HOWEVER, SINCE MOST DELS INSISTED ON RETEN-  
TION OF INTERPRETATIONS, HE FAVORED USE OF ALTERNATIVE  
LANGUAGE FOR EXPRESSING THRESHOLD CONCEPT.

11. MEXICAN DELOFFS (MARIN, CAMPOS) STRESSED IMPORTANCE  
OF COMPREHENSIVE BAN AND ARTICLE III COMMITMENT TO  
CONTRIBUTE TO INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION IN THE "UTILIZA-  
TION, PRESERVATION, AND IMPROVEMENT OF THE ENVIRONMENT."  
WHILE THEY DID NOT EXCLUDE THE POSSIBILITY OF ACCEPTING  
A THRESHOLD BAN, THE MEXICANS HAVE BEEN UNWILLING TO

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 GENEVA 06623 02 OF 02 191055Z

11  
ACTION ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 ARA-06 EUR-12 EA-07 NEA-10 IO-13 ISO-00 ACDE-00

CIAE-00 DODE-00 NSAE-00 NSCE-00 SSO-00 USIE-00 INRE-00

ERDA-05 AF-08 PM-04 H-02 INR-07 L-03 NASA-01 NSC-05

OIC-02 SP-02 PA-01 PRS-01 OES-06 SS-15 SAJ-01 /122 W  
----- 047445

O R 190929Z AUG 76  
FM USMISSION GENEVA  
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 1936  
INFO AMEMBASSY BONN  
AMEMBASSY LONDON  
AMEMBASSY MSOCOW  
AMEMBASSY THE HAGUE  
AMEMBASSY OTTAWA

AMEMBASSY ROME  
AMEMBASSY STOCKHOLM  
AMEMBASSY TOKYO  
USMISSION USUN NY  
USMISSION NATO  
ERDA HQ WASHDC  
ERDA GERMANTOWN MARYLAND  
NOAA ROCKVILLE MARYLAND  
AMEMBASSY BELGRADE  
AMEMBASSY BUCHAREST  
AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI  
AMEMBASSY ISLAMABAD  
AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES  
AMEMBASSY MEXICO

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 2 OF 2 GENEVA 6623

DISTO

DISCUSS COMPROMISE FORMULATIONS THAT MIGHT ENABLE  
THEM TO DO SO. THEY SAID THEY DO NOT EXPECT TO HAVE ANY  
FLEXIBILITY IN THEIR INSTRUCTIONS UNTIL ARRIVAL OF  
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 GENEVA 06623 02 OF 02 191055Z

FOREIGN MINISTER GARCIA ROBLES (PROBABLY TUESDAY AUG 24,) WHO PLANS TO TAKE PART IN ENMOD NEGOTIATIONS DURING HIS STAY IN GENEVA.

12. ROMANIAN REP (ENE), WHILE FAVORING A COMPREHENSIVE BAN, HAS GIVEN INDICATIONS THAT HE COULD ACCEPT THE PRESENT THRESHOLD FORMULA, EVEN RETAINING "WIDESPREAD, LONG-LASTING, OR SEVERE". (HE SUGGESTED THAT "WSLLS" COULD BE DELETED FROM PREAMBLE, WHILE RETAINING TERMS IN OPERATIVE ARTICLE I.) HOWEVER, HE SEEMS TO PREFER DROPPING THE INTERPRETATIONS OF THE THREE CRITERIA, SINCE IN HIS VIEW THEY CONVEY IMPRESSION THAT HOSTILE USES OF ENMOD WITH EFFECTS BELOW THRESHOLD ARE CONDONED.

13. PAKISTAN ALT REP (SALEEM) SAID THAT WHILE PAKISTAN'S OFFICIAL POSITION REMAINED IN FAVOR OF COMPREHENSIVE BAN, HE WOULD PERSONALLY RECOMMEND TO ISLAMABAD AGREEMENT ON THRESHOLD APPROACH PROVIDED AUTHORITIES IN CAPITAL COULD ACCEPT INTERPRETATIONS PROVIDED BY U.S., INCLUDING PROPORTIONALITY ELEMENT.

14. INDIAN REP (MISHRA) SAID HE COULD GO ALONG WITH CHANGE IN EXPRESSION OF BAN PROVIDED THRESHOLD WERE RETAINED.

15. SWEDISH DELOFF INDICATED TH US DELOFF AUG 18

THAT SWEDEN WAS GRUDGINGLY READY TO GO ALONG WITH ENMOD THRESHOLD. HOWEVER, ACCORDING TO SWEDISH DELOFF, SWEDEN WOULD INSIST ON SATISFACTORY INTERPRETATIONS IN ANNEX. (HE REMARKED THAT US INDICATION OF WILLINGNESS TO ADD ELEMENT OF PROPORTIONALITY TO INTERPRETATION OF "SEVERE" HAD BEEN VERY HELPFUL).

16. BERASATEGUI (ARGENTINA) SAID THAT, DESPITE PREFERENCE FOR COMPREHENSIVE AGREEMENT, ARGENTINA COULD ACCEPT A THRESHOLD BAN. HOWEVER, HE HAD SEVERAL DIFFICULTIES WITH PRESENT TEXT: (A) INTERPRETATIONS OF THREE THRESHOLD CRITERIA SHOULD INCLUDE NUMERICAL VALUES (HE CITED SPECIFICALLY 300 SQUARE KILOMETERS AND 3 MONTHS); (B) COMMITMENT SHOULD BE INCLUDED TO CONTINUE NEGOTIATIONS TOWARD COMPREHENSIVE TREATY; (C) TITLE SHOULD BE CHANGED; CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 GENEVA 06623 02 OF 02 191055Z

AND (D) "WSLLS" SHOULD BE REPLACED BY ALTERNATIVE MEANS OF EXPRESSING THRESHOLD.

17. CITING ISSUE OF LEGAL COMPLICATIONS, BERASATEGUI INDICATED THAT LAST OF THESE PROBLEMS (I.E., DELETING "WSLLS") WAS HIS PRIMARY CONCERN. IF TERMS WERE NOT REMOVED, CONVENTION WOULD BE "UNACCEPTABLE." IN THAT CASE, ARGENTINA WOULD NOT NECESSARILY BLOCK CONSENSUS TO TRANSMIT TEXT TO UNGA. BUT, HE SAID, ARGENTINA WOULD CERTAINLY OPPOSE CONVENTION ON FLOOR OF FIRST COMMITTEE.

18. DELOFF ARGUED AGAINST INCLUDING NUMERICAL VALUES IN THRESHOLD INTERPRETATIONS, STATING THAT SUCH VALUES WOULD NECESSARILY BE ARBITRARY AND WOULD INTRODUCE A FALSE SENSE OF PRECISION WHEN, IN PRACTICE, ASSESSMENTS OF EFFECTS WOULD RARELY BE SO PRECISE. BEEASATEGUI LATER INDICATED THAT HE WOULD NOT PRESS FOR CHANGING PRESENT INTERPRETATIONS.

19. AS A REPLACEMENT FOR "WSLLS", BERASATEGUI SUGGESTED "...TECHNIQUES HAVING EFFECTS AS DESCRIBED IN ANNEX I". DELOFF SAID THIS WAS TOO "NEUTRAL". IT WAS IMPORTANT THAT NAY REFORMULATION PROVIDE IN ARTICLE I SOME RATIONALE FOR THE PROHIBITION (E.G. TO AVERT "WSLLS EFFECTS). DELOFF SUGGESTED THE TWO FORMULATIONS CONTAINING THREE SYNONYMOUS WORDS OR PHRASES (PARA 5 ABOVE), BUT BERASATEGUI SAID HE KNEW THAT BUENOS AIRES WOULD NOT FIND THOSE ACCEPTABLE. INSTEAD, HE RECOMMENDED "...TECHNIQUES CAUSING EFFECTS HAVING SUCH HARMFUL CHARACTERISTICS AS THOSE DESCRIBED IN ANNEX I...". HIS IMPRESSION WAS THAT IF US COULD ACCEPT THIS PROPOSAL AND COULD MAKE REFERENCE IN REVIEW CONFERENCE PROVISION TO RESPONSIBILITY OF EXAMINING

EFFECTIVENESS OF TREATY, ARGENTINA WOULD SUPPORT TEXT.

20. ASKED WHAT ARGENTINA WOULD DO IF MEXICO COULD NOT ACCEPT CONVENTION AND OPPOSED IT AT THE UNGA, BERASATEGUI SAID THAT ONCE ARGENTINA ACCEPTED TEXT IN THE CCD, IT WOULD SUPPORT CONVENTION IN NEW YORK, EVEN IF MEXICANS DID NOT. HE ADDED THAT IF US AND ARGENTINA COULD COME TO TERMS, HE WOULD TRY TO PERSUADE GARCIA ROBLES, WITH CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 GENEVA 06623 02 OF 02 191055Z

WHOM HE CLAIMS TO HAVE CLOSE RELATIONSHIP, TO ACCEPT THE COMPROMISE.

21. COMMENT. ALTHOUGH MEXICAN POSITION CANNOT AT THIS STAGE BE PREDICTED, DEL BELIEVES THERE IS A REASONABLE POSSIBILITY THAT ALL OTHER CCD DELEGATIONS WOULD GO ALONG WITH ENMOD CONVENTION IF "WSLLS" WERE REPLACED BY SUITABLE REFORMULATION THAT RETAINED PRESENT INTERPRETATIONS OF THRESHOLD LEVEL. IN THOSE CIRCUMSTANCES, MEXICO MIGHT FIND IT DIFFICULT TO BE LONE DISSENTER. THUS, WE BELIEVE REFORMULATION SUGGESTED ABOVE WOULD GREATLY IMPROVE PROSPECTS FOR CONCLUDING NEGOTIATIONS THIS SUMMER AND FOR WIDELY SUPPORTED TREATY AT UNGA, WHILE RETAINING NOT ONLY BASIC THRESHOLD CONCEPT, BUT ALSO PRESENT LEVEL OF THRESHOLD.

22. FOR THESE REASONS, USDEL REQUESTS AUTHORIZATION TO ACCEPT ARGENTINE PROPOSAL FOR REPLACING "WSLLS" WITH "...TECHNIQUES CAUSING EFFECTS HAVING SUCH HARMFUL CHARACTERISTICS AS THOSE DESCRIBED IN ANNEX I..." (OR SIMILAR FORMULATIONS, SUCH AS "TECHNIQUES HAVING SUCH HARMFUL EFFECTS (CONSEQUENCES) AS THOSE DESCRIBED..." OR "TECHNIQUES CAUSING SUCH HARMFUL EFFECTS AS...").

23. IF DEL RECEIVES SUCH AUTHORIZATION, WE WOULD MAKE CLEAR TO OTHERS THAT WE COULD ONLY COMMIT OURSELVES TO IT IN THE CONTEXT OF THE CONCLUSION OF NEGOTIATIONS ON THE ENTIRE TEXT. CATTO

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01 JAN 1994  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** DISARMAMENT, MEETINGS, MEETING REPORTS, NEGOTIATIONS  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Draft Date:** 19 AUG 1976  
**Decaption Date:** 01 JAN 1960  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** RELEASED  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Authority:** BoyleJA  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:** 25 YEAR REVIEW  
**Disposition Date:** 28 MAY 2004  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1976GENEVA06623  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** n/a  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** GS  
**Errors:** N/A  
**Film Number:** D760318-0165  
**From:** GENEVA  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1976/newtext/t19760839/aaaabhua.tel  
**Line Count:** 372  
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM  
**Office:** ACTION ACDA  
**Original Classification:** CONFIDENTIAL  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 7  
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Previous Classification:** CONFIDENTIAL  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** n/a  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Authority:** BoyleJA  
**Review Comment:** n/a  
**Review Content Flags:**  
**Review Date:** 14 APR 2004  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review History:** RELEASED <14 APR 2004 by ellisoob>; APPROVED <03 AUG 2004 by BoyleJA>  
**Review Markings:**

Margaret P. Grafeld  
Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
04 MAY 2006

**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Referrals:** n/a  
**Review Release Date:** n/a  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** CCD - ENMOD NEGOTIATIONS: ARTICLE I  
**TAGS:** PARM, CCD  
**To:** STATE  
**Type:** TE  
**Markings:** Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006